Minimum Recycled Content to Drive Market Development

How to Get it Done Right

Northeast Recycling Council Webinar
September 24, 2020

NSAC'S VISION: The United States attains a circular economy.

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
Who is NSAC?

The National Stewardship Action Council (NSAC) is a 501©4, formerly affiliated with the California Product Stewardship Council (CPSC). NSAC is a network of committed proponents comprised of governments, non-government organizations, businesses, and consumers who advocate that producers fairly share responsibility in a circular economy.

**Vision:** The United States attains a circular economy.

**Mission:** Collaborate with public and private stakeholders to advance product stewardship and extended producer responsibility.
NSAC Board/Organization

Executive Committee

David Stitzhal
President
Full Circle Environmental

Tim Goncharoff
Vice-President
County of Santa Cruz

Patty Garbarino
Treasurer
Marin Sanitary Service

Constance Hornig
Secretary
Constance Hornig Law Offices

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
NSAC Board (cont.)

Maia Corbitt  
Garver, Black, Hilyard  
Family Foundation

Bob Gedert  
Consultant

Jordan Fengel  
State of Texas Alliance for Recycling

Beverly Hanstrom  
Colorado Medical Waste

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
NSAC Board (cont.)

Nicholas Oliver
State of California
Department of Consumer Affairs

Chris Ripley
Smarter Sorting

Rubi Rajbanshi
Terrascope Consulting

Michael Simpson
City of Los Angeles

Eric Zetz
Merced Regional Waste Mgmt Authority
What is a Circular Economy?

Multi-faceted with a focus on producers embracing sustainable design, using regenerative materials and collecting end of life products and materials for continuous use in the economy. It is based on three principles:

1. Design out waste and pollution
2. Keep products and materials in use
3. Regenerate natural systems
Market Development Laws in CA

1. State Agency Buy-Recycled Campaign (SABRC)
2. Ridged Plastic Packaging Containers (RPPC)
3. Newsprint
4. Plastic Bags
5. Glass
6. EPR/Product Stewardship
8. Pending Legislation

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
1. State Agency Buy-Recycled Campaign (SABRC) 1989 (31 years)

- Joint effort between CalRecycle and DGS
- Required to purchase made with post-consumer recycled content (PCRC) products
- Annual reporting
- 11 categories of material types
- At least 50 percent of purchases
- Minimum PCRC requirement for each category

https://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/buyrecycled/stateagency

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
1. State Agency Buy-Recycled Campaign FY 2018-19 Results By Product Type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Product Category</th>
<th>Total SABRC Reportable Dollars</th>
<th>Total SABRC Compliant Dollars</th>
<th>% SABRC Compliant Spending</th>
<th>No. of Agencies Reporting in Each Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antifreeze</td>
<td>$8,157,234.26</td>
<td>$7,589,917.97</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compost, Co-compost &amp; Mulch</td>
<td>$3,667,807.73</td>
<td>$3,184,785.12</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glass Products</td>
<td>$7,697,208.73</td>
<td>$5,552,158.20</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubricating Oils</td>
<td>$6,038,841.71</td>
<td>$5,059,253.98</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metal Products</td>
<td>$271,954,627.61</td>
<td>$232,889,941.45</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paint</td>
<td>$9,388,689.01</td>
<td>$5,716,010.47</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paper Products</td>
<td>$30,717,792.25</td>
<td>$24,180,418.20</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plastic Products</td>
<td>$37,018,082.51</td>
<td>$26,568,272.71</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printing and Writing Paper</td>
<td>$30,413,998.90</td>
<td>$20,596,198.76</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tire-derived Products</td>
<td>$4,854,342.24</td>
<td>$4,434,973.93</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tires</td>
<td>$8,576,422.03</td>
<td>$597,126.28</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>$418,485,046.98</strong></td>
<td><strong>$336,369,057.07</strong></td>
<td><strong>80</strong></td>
<td><strong>n/a</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
Statewide SABRC Compliance 2018-2019

- $336 million (80%)
- $82 million (20%)

SABRC Compliant Purchases
SABRC Non-Compliant Purchases
SABRC Purchases vs. All Statewide Product Purchases for FY 2018-19

- Total SABRC Compliant Purchases
- All Statewide Product Purchases
Opportunities for SABRC Improvement

1. Clarify that SABRC covers **all purchases** of goods by state agencies **and contractors**
2. Include service contracts where the contractor is purchasing reportable recycled products in the performance of the service contract
3. **Revise product categories, and minimum content percentages and update every three years at minimum**
4. Remove requirement to purchase only when available at the same or lesser total cost than non-recycled products
5. Codify CalRecycles’ established process for non-compliant agencies and provide more enforcement tools
6. Require annual mandatory online training for procurement and contracting officers
7. Clarify definition of compost – 85% recycled content if compost was a category??
2. Rigid Plastic Packaging Container Program (RPPC) 1991 and amended – 29 yrs!

- California’s law requires product manufacturers that sell products held in RPPCs meet one of the compliance options
  - One compliance option: must be made from at least 25% postconsumer material
  - One compliance option: Lightweighting
  - Penalties of up to $100,000 annually

https://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Plastics/RPPC/
What is an RPPC?

Self-Determination

- CalRecycle developed two self-determination tools for product manufacturers:
  1. Quick checklist with three questions regarding a product’s packaging
  2. Expanded Self-Determination Checklist to be used if additional review is necessary after using the quick checklist
- All product packaging container determinations are made on a case-by-case basis

Examples of Products in RPPCs

RPPCs are used by a diverse community of product manufacturers. The products include, but are not limited to:

- Adhesives
- Cleaning Products
- Hardware
- Paints & Coatings
- Arts and Crafts
- Computers
- Lubricants
- Sealants
- Automotive Products
- Electronics
- Office Supplies
- Toys
Defined RPPC’s

https://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/Plastics/RPPC/SelfDetermin/

Examples of Regulated RPPCs

The RPPCs used by product manufacturers range in shape, color, size, and form. RPPCs can include, but are not limited to, the examples below (most photos include rulers to represent container height and width):

**Buckets.** The example bucket is cylindrical, straight-based, and opaque and includes a snap-on lid and a metal handle.

**Jugs.** The example jug is opaque and cylindrical with a built-in handle and funnel top, featuring a threaded cap.

**Pails.** The example pail is cylindrical, straight-based, and opaque and includes a snap-on lid and metal handle.

**Clamshells (both heat-sealed and reclosable).** The example is rectangular and clear and opens like a clamshell with a hinge. The two sides overlap slightly, forming a closure.

**Tubes.** The example tubes are cylindrical and opaque with different lids. One lid was sealed during manufacturing and one lid is threaded and resealable.

**Clamshells (both heat-sealed and reclosable).** The example is rectangular and clear and opens like a clamshell with a hinge. The two sides overlap slightly, forming a closure.
Problems:

- Complicated, too many ways to comply
  - Ex: Lightweighting for source reduction and other methods results in companies able to justify what they are already able to do which may not be including higher RC
- CalRecycle not historically focused on enforcement
- Last enforcement order was 2018 – why?
- Relying on producers to self-verify, no 3rd party verification of tons sold

### 2005 RPPC Certification Cycle Penalties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company Name</th>
<th>Agreement Number</th>
<th>Type of Penalty</th>
<th>Amount of Penalty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PETCO Animal Supplies</td>
<td>No agreement executed.</td>
<td>Container Violation</td>
<td>$42,025.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Max</td>
<td>No agreement executed.</td>
<td>Container Violation</td>
<td>$34,350.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sony Corporation</td>
<td>No agreement executed.</td>
<td>Container Violation</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total: $126,375.84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Opportunities for RPPC Improvement

1. Enforcement must be stronger - $100,000 max in annual penalties is not enough
2. Add 3rd party verification for volumes sold and RC
3. Provide funding for state agency oversight
4. CalRecycle needs to be much more on top of this program! Or, maybe we need to totally review and update it
5. Update/limit compliance methods or be more specific by product type how they can comply
3. Recycled Newsprint Law

- CA law mandates the use of a specified amount of recycled-content newsprint (RCN) by printers and publishers located in CA, and CalRecycle implements the program to encourage and track the use of RCN.

- RCN is defined as newsprint comprised of at least 40% postconsumer waste-paper fiber by weight

  - At least 50% of the newsprint used for printing and publishing by each commercial printer and publisher (“consumers”) in California must be RCN

  - Consumers (printers and publishers), suppliers and manufacturers must comply with the program requirements

https://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/buyrecycled/newsprint
Opportunities for Newsprint Improvement

1. 3rd party verification of producers reporting
2. Ban sale in CA for non-compliance
3. Paying for state oversight and enforcement costs to address the lack of enforcement – last compliance report was from 2011 and last enforcement order was 2009
4. RCN Quality Standards last updated in 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Program Type</th>
<th>Enforcement Order</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Apr 17, 2009</td>
<td>Recycled-Content Newsprint</td>
<td>Administrative Penalty for Wave Community Newspapers for Late Submittal of Newsprint Consumer Certification. April 17, 2009.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apr 17, 2004</td>
<td>Recycled-Content Newsprint</td>
<td>Administrative Penalty for San Dieguito Printers for late submittal of Newsprint Consumer Certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 16, 1999</td>
<td>Recycled-Content Newsprint</td>
<td>Administrative Penalty for Quebecor Printing, San Jose for late submittal of Newsprint Consumer Certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nov 16, 1999</td>
<td>Recycled-Content Newsprint</td>
<td>Administrative Penalty for Pizazz Printing for late submittal of Newsprint Consumer Certification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 29, 1998</td>
<td>Recycled-Content Newsprint</td>
<td>Administrative Penalty for Publishers' Printing Service, Inc. dba Day and Night For Failure to Submit Newsprint Consumer Certifications</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Plastic Trash Bag Program

- Requires plastic trash bag manufacturers to use min. 10% of PC material to produce the trash bags sold in CA. OR 30% RC across entire plastic product line sold
- Noncompliant companies are ineligible for award of any state contract or subcontract.
- CalRecycle is authorized to audit companies

https://www.calrecycle.ca.gov/BuyRecycled/TrashBags/
Opportunities for Trash Bag Improvement

1. Require producers to pay for CalRecycle oversight and enforcement including auditing which can be expensive with out of state producers

2. Penalties should increase to be banned from sale, not just ineligible for state contracts

3. CalRecycle Enforcement Orders imposed – currently none with pages of non-compliant companies on their website!

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
5. Glass

- CA manufacturers of new glass containers must use at least 35% postconsumer recycled glass, or 25% if the cullet is mixed-color.
- Fiberglass insulation manufacturers must use at least 30% postconsumer glass.
- In recent years, the two industries in California have used more than 700,000 tons of cullet annually.
- Producers and Processors required to report (triangulate).
- Quality Incentive Payment (QIP) program is designed to improve the quality and marketability. Certified recyclers and processors are encouraged to clean and color sort glass in return for a Quality Incentive Payment for each ton recycled.
Opportunities for Glass Improvement

It's working pretty darn well now!

1. Update RC number to 50% (tried and failed)
   - Ave. now around 46% (not enough collected)
Reusable Plastic Bag Law (Bag Ban)

- SB 270 prohibits the distribution of single-use plastic grocery bags and requires that all paper and reusable bags meet specific requirements
- Lessons learned from previous RC bills
  - Required third party certification of producers
  - Paying for state agency oversight
  - Narrow exception for reusable plastic bag producers that demonstrate that their plastic bags meet specified reusability, recycling, and recycled content standards
• Require plastic beverage containers subject to the Bottle Bill to contain specified percentages of postconsumer recycled plastic annually:
  i) From January 1, 2022 until December 31, 2024, no less than 15%;
  ii) From January 1, 2025 until December 31, 2029, no less than 25%; and,
  iii) On and after January 1, 2030, no less than 50%.
• World's toughest plastic bottle RC law, exceeding the European Union's standards
• Potentially significant "off ramps" for companies to seek waivers that could limit the law's impact
• Under the bill, manufacturers missing the targets are subject to penalty fees, which are 20 cents for each pound of PCR they fell short by.
• Fees are deposited into a new “Recycling Enhancement Penalty Account” and is to be spent on recycling, infrastructure, collection and processing of plastic beverage bottles
• AB 792 (Ting) was vetoed by the Governor in 2019

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
We Have to Think Differently…
And a Circular Economy is Not What We Have Now…

“The definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over again—but expecting different results.”
6. CA Carpet Product Stewardship

- Carpet eco-modulated fees can drive RC
- EX: AB 729 (Chu) – Sponsored by NSAC
  - Replaces the (existing) assessment with differential assessments that take into account the financial burden that a particular carpet material has on the stewardship program, and the amount of postconsumer recycled content contained in a particular carpet, as prescribed.

![Receipt Image]

© copyright National Stewardship Action Council, 2020
Eco-Modulated Fees
Ex: Recycled Content Criteria

- Germany: German Packaging Act (VerpackG) obliges PROs to incentivize the use of recycled content
  - Packaging recycling fees charged by recovery organizations must be based on 'ecological criteria'. This means lower recycling fees for packaging that is more easily recycled and that contains recycled material or renewable raw materials.
- France: CITEO (only active household packaging recovery organization operating) must charge 50% lower recycling fees for packaging materials which comprise at least 50% recycled content.
  - CITEO must finance this lower packaging recycling fee by increasing the recycling fees for plastic.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Stewardship Action Council</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Table 4-1: Overview of Packaging Fee Modulation in the EU**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>'Basic' modulation - i.e. different fees per material type</th>
<th>Greater granularity in fee structure - e.g. specific fees for certain types of packaging e.g. PET/HDPE, beverage cartons etc.</th>
<th>'Advanced' modulation (e.g. penalty fees, or numerous different fee levels within material type)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malta</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© copyright Nati

+ recycled content!
7. Recycling Market Development Zones (RMDZ)

- Combines recycling with economic development to fuel new businesses, expand existing ones, create jobs, and divert waste from landfills.
- Provides attractive loans, technical assistance, and free product marketing to businesses that use materials from the waste stream to manufacture their products and are located in a zone.
- Covers ~88,000 square miles of CA from the Oregon border to San Diego.
- Loan Interest Rate: 4.0 percent.
- Available Loan Funds: FY 2020-21 $5,901,000.
- The RMDZ CEQA Tool Kit is a series of web pages designed to guide a potential or existing zone through the CEQA process.

https://www2.calrecycle.ca.gov/BizAssistance/Zones/
California Statewide Commission on Markets and Curbside Recycling

Next Meeting: Wednesday, 10/7/2020
8:30 AM - 12:30 PM Pacific
Webcast

https://www2.calrecycle.ca.gov/PublicNotices/Details/4108
Statewide Commission on Recycling Markets and Curbside Recycling

Recommendations shall address strategies that will help CalRecycle:

- Increase market demand for postconsumer waste materials
- Increase demand for recycled content products
- Promote systems that yield high quality feedstocks
- Promote competitive collection and use of secondary waste materials
- Meet the state's waste reduction goals
- Meet the state’s methane emission reduction goals to reduce the amount of organics disposed in landfills

www.calrecycle.ca.gov/markets/commission
Meetings & Information Listserv

- Commission meetings will be held on the first and third Wednesday of the month from 8:30am – 12:30pm
- Subscribe to the listserv for updates: https://www2.calrecycle.ca.gov/Listservs/Subscribe/166
Public Comment Portal

- Members of the public who wish to comment during the meeting may do so using the portal.
  [https://www2.calrecycle.ca.gov/Forms/Feedback/PublicComments](https://www2.calrecycle.ca.gov/Forms/Feedback/PublicComments)

- When using the Portal, please select “Workshop” from the initial drop-down menu.

- Due to time constraints oral comments are limited to three (3) minutes and written comments should be limited to 500 words or less.
Think About This….

"Leaders think and talk about the solutions. Followers think and talk about the problems."

Brian Tracy
Heidi Sanborn
Executive Director
Cell: (916) 217-1109
Heidi@nsaction.us

Connect with us!

www.nsaction.us